Alan F. Ciamporcero Senior Counsel 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W Suite 400 Washington, DC 20004 (202) 383-6416



RECEIVED

RM 8491

JUN - 2 1994

June 2, 1994 FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

William F. Caton Acting Secretary Federal Communications Commission Mail Stop 1170 1919 M Street, N.W., Room 222 Washington, D.C. 20554

> Re: Petition for Relief of Center for Media Education, Consumer Federation of America, Office of Communication of the United Church of Christ, National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, National Council of La Raza.

Dear Mr. Caton:

This letter responds to and opposes Petitioners May 23, 1994 informal request for relief. Petitioners' conclusion is patently wrong. Pacific Bell has not engaged in electronic redlining. To the contrary, Pacific Bell is committed to providing advanced telecommunications facilities and services, including video dialtone, to all California customers. We intend to upgrade our facilities statewide to serve 1.5 million homes by the end of 1996, 5 million homes by the year 2000 and, by 2010, the advanced telecommunications network will reach all of our customers. But we cannot build everywhere at once.

If Petitioners had asked, we would have shared our plans and studies demonstrating that our initial deployment will serve a representative mix of Californians. Our deployment plans for the next two years will bring video dialtone services to Californians who generally approximate the income and racial diversity of the state as a whole. Our initial construction will begin in four areas but we plan to expand quickly into contiguous areas. We do not plan to "skip over" areas. Unlike other proposals, we will be upgrading our entire statewide network to provide advanced telecommunications services, including improved telephony services. Video dialtone will be only one of the services available. Our planning and the related deployment are driven by the commitment to provide these advanced services to all California customers. The initial deployment clusters and geographic areas described in our Section 214 Applications reflect that commitment.

On the other hand, we have also pledged not to raise basic residential rates to fund construction. Our deployment plans must permit us to honor that commitment and introduce commercially viable services. We expressly considered five criteria in our deployment strategy: provision of service to all Californians; the competitive environment; existing infrastructure; demand for services; and engineering efficiencies. These criteria will continue to guide us and will permit us to provide advanced services to all California customers by 2010.

Petitioners' conclusions rely on a study by Dr. Mark N. Cooper. Dr. Cooper claims his analysis shows a clear pattern of redlining. Based on rudimentary information, Dr. Cooper concludes that areas that are predominately lower income and minority have not been provided for in video dialtone proposals, with the consequence that there will be a failure to serve the lowest income areas. First, Dr. Cooper's study of the Pacific Bell Applications is fundamentally flawed by his failure to include California's Asian residents. Asians make up a significant group of Californians.

In addition, it is impossible to evaluate the validity of his conclusions because Dr. Cooper fails to provide sufficient explanation of his methodology. For example, what was the effect of using different comparison areas — the San Diego served area is compared with the rest of that CMSA but Orange County and the South Bay served areas are compared with entire counties? What areas were included (or excluded) from the category of "unserved" areas for this analysis? What levels of differences between served and unserved areas would be significant? Even more significantly, Dr. Cooper entirely omits any analysis of our plans for Los Angeles, California's most populous city.

Pacific Bell endorses the Commission's concept of universal service for video dialtone. We too wish to avoid an "information rich -- information poor" society. For that reason, independent of our video dialtone applications, this Spring we said that we will provide all public schools, libraries and community colleges with connections for computer communications and videoconferencing by the end of 1996. With approval from the California Public Utilities Commission, we will wire locations within each institution for video and data applications, install service for free and waive the usage charges for one year after installation. We will also work with the CPUC to develop a special educational access rate that will help ensure universal telecommunications service for educational institutions.

Pacific Bell supports the Commission's video dialtone goals, including the availability of video dialtone facilities to all, regardless of income, race or ethnicity. We believe our deployment plans reflect our commitment to provide advanced

telecommunications facilities for the benefit of all Californians. Petitioners have not supported their conclusions as to Pacific Bell or justified the requested relief. The Commission should decline to act on the Petition. If, however, the Commission decides otherwise, the analysis of Pacific Bell's plans should be statewide, given the statewide nature of our network upgrade. Reviewing Pacific Bell's statewide deployment plans at the wire center or local area level would be unreasonable.

cc: Service List

Dean F. Craing over

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Chuck Nordstrom, hereby certify that copies of the foregoing "REPLY LETTER OF PACIFIC BELL " Re: Petition for Relief From Unjust And Unreasonable Discrimination In The Deployment Of Video Dialtone Facilities filed by Center for Media Education et al were served by hand or by first-class United States mail, postage prepaid, upon the parties appearing on the attached service list this 2nd day of June, 1994.

BY: Chuck Mordstrom
Chuck Nordstrom

PACIFIC BELL 140 New Montgomery Street San Francisco, CA 94105

SERVICE LIST

Reed E. Hundt*
Chairman
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 814
Washington, D. C. 20554

James H. Quello*
Commissioner
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 802
Washington, D. C. 20554

Gregory J. Vogt, Chief*
Tariff Division
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 518
Washington, D. C. 20554

Greg Lipscomb*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
2025 M Street, N. W.
Room 6008
Washington, D. C. 20554

James D. Schlichting*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 544
Washington, D. C. 20554

Andrew C. Barrett*
Commissioner
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 826
Washington, D. C. 20554

Gerald P. Vaughan*
Deputy Chief
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 500
Washington, D. C. 20554

Donna Lampert*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 545
Washington, D. C. 20554

Olga Madruga-Forti*
Acting Chief
Federal Communications
Commission
2025 M Street, N. W.
Room 6008
Washington, D. C. 20554

Todd F. Silbergeld*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 544
Washington, D. C. 20554

Gary Phillips*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 544
Washington, D. C. 20554

James R. Keegan, Chief*
Domestic Facilities Division
Federal Communications
Commission
2025 M Street, N. W.
Room 6010
Washington, D. C. 20554

The Honorable Togo D. West, Jr. Secretary of the Army
The Pentagon
Washington, D. C. 20310

Governor Pete Wilson Office of the Governor State Capitol Sacramento, CA 95814

Stuart F. Feldstein
Matthew D. Emmer
FLEISCHMAN AND WALSH
Attorneys for CENTURY
COMMUNICATIONS CORPORATION
1400 16th Street, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20036

David Krech*
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications
Commission
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 500
Washington, D. C. 20554

INTERNATIONAL TRANSCRIPTION*
SERVICE, INC. (ITS)
1919 M Street, N. W.
Room 246
Washington, D. C. 20554

The Honorable Jon H. Dalton Secretary of the Navy The Pentagon Washington, D. C. 20350

James S. Blaszak
Patrick J. Whittle
Gardner, Carton & Douglas
Attorneys for AD HOC
TELECOMMUNICATIONS USERS
COMMITTEE
1301 K Street, N. W.
Suite 900, East Tower
Washington, D. C. 20005

James K. Hahn, City Attorney
Pedro B. Echeverria,
Senior Assistant City Attorney
Edward J. Perez
Assistant City Attorney
CITY OF LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA
Room 1800, City Hall East
200 North Main Street
Los Angeles, California 90012

Brenda L. Fox
Michael S. Schooler
Suzanne M. Perry
DOW, LOHNES & ALBERTSON
Attorneys for
CABLEVISION INDUSTRIES, INC.
COMCAST CABLE COMM., INC.
1255 - 23rd Street, N. W.
Suite 500
Washington, D. C. 20037

Debra L. Lagapa
LEVINE, LAGAPA AND BLOCK
Attorneys for the CALIFORNIA
BANKERS CLEARING HOUSE AND
THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES
1200 Nineteenth Street, N. W.
Suite 602
Washington, D. C. 20036

Werner K. Hartenberger
Laura H. Phillips
Jane E. Jackson
Attorneys for COX
ENTERPRISES, INC.
1255 Twenty-Third St.', N. W.
Suite 500
Washington, D. C. 20037

Daniel L. Brenner
David L. Nicoll
Counsel for the NATIONAL CABLE
TELEVISION ASSOCIATION, INC.
1724 Massachusetts Avenue, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20036

Peter Arth, Jr.
Edward W. O'Neill
Mark Fogelman
Attorneys for the PEOPLE OF
THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES
COMMISSION OF THE STATE
OF CALIFORNIA
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, California 94102

Alan J. Gardner
Vice President, Regulatory
and Legal Affairs
CALIFORNIA CABLE TELEVISION
ASSOCIATION
4341 Piedmont Avenue
Oakland, California 94611

Jeffrey Sisheimer
Director of Regulatory Affairs
CALIFORNIA CABLE TELEVISION
ASSOCIATION
4341 Piedmont Avenue
Oakland, California 94611

Frank W. Lloyd
MINTZ, LEVIN, COHN, FERRIS,
GLOVSKY, AND POPEO, P.C.
Attorneys for the CALIFORNIA
CABLE TELEVISION ASSOCIATION
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N. W.
Suite 900
Washington, D. C. 20004

Kathleen O'Reilly 510 E. Street, S. E. Washington, D. C. 20003 Angela J. Campbell
Citizens Communications Center
Institute for Public
Representation
Georgetown University Law
Center
600 New Jersey Avenue, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20001

Andrew Jay Schwartzman Counsel for Media Access Project 2000 M Street, N. W. Washington, D. C. 20036